

SAN FRANCISCO BAY AREA RAPID TRANSIT DISTRICT
2150 Webster Street, P.O. Box 12688, Oakland, CA 94604-2688

BART ACCESSIBILITY TASK FORCE
Committee Meeting Minutes
June 22, 2023

1. Roll Call of Members:

1. Anita Ortega
2. Catherine Callahan
3. Clarence Fischer
4. Don Queen
5. Emily Witkin
6. Gerry Newell (Vice-Chair) - ABSENT
7. Herb Hastings (2nd Vice-Chair) - ABSENT
8. Janice Armigo Brown
9. Larry Bunn - ABSENT
10. Randall Glock (Chair)
11. Roland Wong
12. VACANT
13. VACANT
14. VACANT
15. VACANT
16. VACANT
17. VACANT
18. VACANT

Quorum of six in-person BATF members. Eight BATF members in total attended in-person. “Just Cause,” was not used for this meeting.

BART Customer Access and Accessibility Department Staff:

Elena Van Loo
Bob Franklin

BART Director (s), BART Staff, Speakers, and members of the public:

Director Robert Raburn
Wendy Wheeler (BART Staff)
Sabrina Baptiste (BART Staff)
Bridgett Nolot (Captioner)

Alicia Garispe (Captioner)
Daveed Mandell (Guest)
Bruce Yow (Guest)
Natalie Maxwell (Guest)
Shira Leeder (Guest)
Annie Koruga (Guest)
Sergio Valencia (Guest)

2. Public Comments

No public comments.

3. Approval of May 25, 2023 Meeting Minutes

Randall Glock moved to correct agenda item, “Approval of April 27, 2023 meeting minutes,” to, “Approval of May 25, 2023 meeting minutes.” Clarence Fischer seconded the motion.

Motion was passed unanimously to correct June’s agenda to approve May 25, 2023 meeting minutes from April 27, 2023 meeting minutes.

Clarence Fischer moved approval of the May 25, 2023 meeting minutes. Roland Wong seconded the motion.

- Motion passes with six (6) in favor, zero (0) against, and one (1) abstention.

4. Next Generation BART Faregates

Wendy Wheeler presented on “Next generation BART faregates.”

She highlighted faregate features, which will first be installed at the West Oakland BART Station.

She went over, “qualification highlights”:

- Proposed solution met each BART requirement specifically, without exception
- Faregates in service for more than 3.94 billion rides annually (pre-COVID)
- 26 years of experience with sensor technology
- Fully open architecture and modular design
- Extensive integration experience with TR4 and legacy systems
- STraffic has deployed more than 16,000 faregates

She went over, “improved customer experience – Accessibility,”:

- STraffic has worked extensively with the ADA community and incorporated learnings into faregate designs
 - Equipped with top and side-mounted readers
 - Sensor technology for safe access of persons and service animals
 - Aisle lighting, messaging, and color-coding options

She mentioned the next generation faregates will have advanced sensor technology to detect, piggybacking, bicycle luggage, wheelchair, tailgating, and no facial recognition. She noted the gates comply with BART's Surveillance Ordinance by blurring the images, so no clear facial images are captured for analysis.

She went over the next generation faregate diagram to prevent fare evasions:

- Alarms – Piggy backing and crawl over the faregate
- Can not crawl under the faregate
- Modular overhead bridge makes it harder to climb over
- The gate will close when someone is coming in on the opposite direction and didn't pay.

She mentioned that all the next generation faregates have the ability to be bi-directional.

She mentioned next generation BART faregates will be piloted at West Oakland BART Station, as it is geographically close to the BART Maintenance and Engineering Staff where the new generation faregates will have a faster turn-around-time if faregates needs maintenance attention.

Wendy Wheeler went over the next generation faregates initial deployment schedule starting in 2023, with a completion in 2025.

Clarence Fisher asked how will the next generation faregate not detect piggyback riders if a parent is carrying a child under five years old or walking the child through the faregate. Wendy Wheeler mentioned this is something her department is still working on this.

Roland Wong asked if the audio sounds from the current faregates will be the same as the new generation faregates. Wendy Wheeler stated the audio sounds from the current faregates will be the same with the new generation faregates.

Roland Wong asked if the new generation faregates will have one panel or two panels and Wendy Wheeler answered there will be two panels.

Randall Glock encouraged BATF members and members of the public to go to West Oakland BART Station to test the new generation faregates when they are installed in a few weeks.

Natalie Maxwell introduced themselves and mentioned they work for the Center for Independence in Berkeley as a transportation trainer. They expressed concerns why the pilot is at West Oakland BART Station and voiced concerns with the next generation faregate style. Natalie Maxwell thinks the money is not being spent wisely and best to spend it on increasing accessibility within the BART system along with better wayfinding in and around BART.

Natalie Maxwell expressed concerns with the size of the new generation faregate. Wendy Wheeler mentioned the size of the current faregate will be the same size as the new generation faregate and does comply with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA).

Natalie Maxwell mentioned riders are not familiar with different sounds when processing your Clipper Card. They shared there should be an outreach to educate what the different beeps represents, especially people who are visually impaired or a person who is blind.

Annie stated she was at a previous BATF meeting and she mentioned the old faregates do not show remaining balance on the side or above and asked if the new generation faregates will show the remaining balance. Wendy Wheeler mentioned she will look into this.

Clarence Fischer confirmed the new generation faregates will not take BART paper magnet tickets and Wendy Wheeler confirmed the new generation faregates will only take Clipper Cards.

Randall Glock thanked Wendy Wheeler for her presentation.

5. Change Schedule BATF Public Meeting Time From 2:00 pm to 1:00 pm- A Discussion

Randall Glock lead the agenda item to change scheduled BATF meeting time from 2:00 pm to 1:00 pm.

Randall Glock shared he was approached from a BATF member to look into changing the meeting time. He expressed that when the time changes it gets darker just around when the meeting ends and it is the height of the evening commute.

Roland Wong stated he is in favor to change the time to 1:00 pm. He mentioned pre pandemic, it was very difficult to load the train due to heavy number of commuters around 4:30 pm when BATF meetings ends. Roland Wong stated if meeting ends at 3:30 pm, the train won't be as crowded and it is still daylight.

Clarence motioned to vote to change the scheduled BATF meeting time from 2:00 pm to 1:00 pm. Roland Wong seconded the motion.

- Motion does not pass with four (4) noes, three (3) in favor, and zero (0) abstention.

Randall Glock confirmed BATF scheduled meeting starting time remains at 2:00 pm.

6. BATF Goals for 2023

Clarence Fischer mentioned one of the goals is to continue to be involved with the new generation faregates. He stated he would like to see BATF members be involved with testing the new generation faregates at the pilot station, West Oakland BART Station.

Anita Ortega stated getting AC Transit and BART trains schedule to be more coordinated between the two agencies and added during COVID-19, AC Transit cut some bus stops. She mentioned to have BATF members reach out to staff and see what can be done.

Randall Glock mentioned another big goal is recruiting new BATF members. He asked as a committee, how BATF members can reach out to potentially get new BATF members.

Elena Van Loo shared that there was a BART news article on June 1, 2023 entitled "BART is recruiting new members of the BART Accessibility Task Force (BATF)," and mentioned about ten people have expressed interest, which is good news.

Director Robert Raburn suggested to have an agenda where there are a list dates of BART events or BART street fairs and maybe have flyers available to recruit BATF members.

7. Member Announcements

No member announcements

8. Staff Announcements

Elena Van Loo announced:

- 2nd quarter travel reimbursement will be turned in on July 10, 2023.
- It is the responsibility of BATF members to let Elena know to update the card number if there are any changes to the RTC or Senior discount card number.
- She will schedule an agenda item to discuss having an in-person BATF Holiday Reception on December 13, 2023.

Bob Franklin shared he is working on getting approval at the July 27, 2023 BART Board of Directors meeting to increase the travel stipend for all BART Advisory Committee members.

Director Robert Raburn thanked BATF members and members of the public for their services.

9. Chairperson Announcements

No chair announcements

10. Future Agenda Topics – Member Suggest Topics

- List of BART events, BART fairs to promote BATF recruitment
- Approve in-person BATF Holiday Reception December 13, 2023
- Change the BATF By-Laws under Article V, Termination of membership
 - Members has missed four regular meetings in a calendar year...There is no provision for excused absences
 - Herb Hasting requested via email

11. Adjournment

The meeting adjourned at 3:07 pm until the next regularly scheduled meeting, July 27, 2023 at 2pm.