

SAN FRANCISCO BAY AREA RAPID TRANSIT DISTRICT
2150 Webster Street, P.O. Box 12688, Oakland, CA 94604-2688

BART ACCESSIBILITY TASK FORCE
Committee Meeting Minutes
October 26, 2023

1. Roll Call of Members:

1. Anita Ortega
2. Annie Koruga
3. Bruce Yow
4. Catherine Callahan
5. Clarence Fischer
6. Daveed Mandell
7. Don Queen
8. Emily Witkin
9. Janice Armigo Brown (2nd Vice-Chair)
10. Randall Glock (Chair)
11. Roland Wong (Vice-Chair)
12. VACANT
13. VACANT
14. VACANT
15. VACANT
16. VACANT
17. VACANT
18. VACANT

Quorum of 6 (six) in-person BATF members. Annie Koruga and Janice Armigo Brown used “Just Cause,” for the first time.

BART Customer Access and Accessibility Department Staff:

Elena Van Loo
Matt West
Bob Franklin

BART Director (s), BART Staff, Speakers, and members of the public:

Director Robert Raburn
Wendy Wheeler (BART Staff)
Sagar Shah (BART Staff)

Sara Hill (Captioner)
Edith Eaton (Captioner)
Hillary Brown (Guest)
Danny Kodmur (Guest)
Alex Tiphayachan (Guest)
Roger Acuna (Guest)
Natalie Maxwell (Guest)
Jasher Noland (Guest)
Sarah Desumala (Guest)
Jerry Grace (Guest)

2. Public Comments

Roger Acuna mentioned the platform door markers do not indicate the boarding area for the center door of the three-door trains (Fleet of the Future) and hopes that this will be addressed.

3. Approval of September 28, 2023 meeting minutes

Clarence Fischer moved approval of the September 28, 2023 meeting minutes with amendments. Janice Armigo Brown seconded the motion.

- Motion passes with nine (9) in favor, zero (0) against, and zero (0) abstention

4. Next Generation Faregate update

Wendy Wheeler presented on the item, “Next Generation Faregate update.” Sagar Shah, BART Staff was present to answer questions.

Wendy Wheeler shared that West Oakland BART Station will be the pilot station for the new generation faregates. She stated the new generation faregates will be double panel doors and mentioned the pilot faregates does include Accessible Faregates (AGF). She mentioned new generation faregates may not be the final design.

She went over the West Oakland Prototype gates: they are about seven (7) feet tall, there are like bird spikes on top of the faregates. She mentioned there are three different types of doors which are about six (6) feet tall. Wendy Wheeler stated the three different types of doors have not been decided and want to hear from the public which prototype doors works best or does not work.

She mentioned STraffic has worked extensively with Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) communities and incorporated learning into the faregate designs:

- Equipped with top and side-mounted readers
- Sensor technology for safe access of people and service animals
- Aisle lighting, massaging, and color-coding options

She shared different displayed messages when entering or exiting BART stations to improve customer experience:

- Tap again
- Add fare
- See agent
- Do not enter
- Exit here
- Maintenance
- Card accepted

She went over faregate audio messaging:

- Used to convey faregate messages for blind/low vision passengers
- Audible tones (error, successful entry...)
 - will remain the same during initial rollout
- New faregates will have improved sounds (BART staff will update BATF for input in the future during systemwide rollout)

She went over faregate sensors. Wendy Wheeler mentioned there are sixteen (16) sensors in the faregate and will detect and determine movement of passengers (authorized and unauthorized) between the free and paid areas.

She mentioned the overhead cameras are located in the middle of the new generation faregates and will be able to detect (advanced sensor technology):

- Piggybacking
- Bicycles
- Luggage
- Wheelchairs (one in wheelchair and other pushing wheelchair)
- Tailgating
- No facial recognition

Wendy Wheeler went over the next generation initial deployment timeline, which is subject to change:

- Year 2023 – Issued notice to proceed, project progress update to BART Board of Directors, visit to STRaffic in Korea and Virginia, install prototype at West Oakland BART Station
- Year 2024 – Door style decision, begin and complete deployment of first eight (8) stations, begin deployment of remaining stations
- Year 2025 – Districtwide replacement complete

Roland Wong asked if the beeps and/or audio will be the as the old faregates with the new generation faregates. Wendy Wheeler mentioned the sounds/audio will remain the same with the new generation faregates and added this can change in the future.

Roland Wong asked for clarification if there will be picograms on the sides of the new generation faregates. Wendy Wheeler stated there is no space for the picograms on the side of the new generation faregates. Wendy Wheeler noted the new generation faregates may not be the final design.

Daveed Mandell had two concerns. He asked to consider adding audio wayfinding to locate the faregates for people who are blind or people with low vision. His second concern was about the direction of the arrows when entering BART station. He stated the arrows should be in the opposite directions of entrance to the BART station. Wendy Wheeler mentioned she will discuss with staff of Daveed Mandell's considerations.

Members expressed the desire to visit the West Oakland BART Station to test the prototype faregates and give feedback.

Clarence Fischer asked if the new Accessible Faregate (AFG) doors will be bi-directional and Wendy Wheeler confirmed that the faregates will be bi-directional.

Clarence Fischer asked if the new faregate prototype will be able to take Clipper Cards and BART paper tickets and Wendy Wheeler mentioned faregates will only process with Clipper Cards. She added that as of November 30, 2023, all faregates will no longer able to process BART paper tickets. Clarence Fischer asked if there be a public announcement that magstripe tickets will not be accepted at faregates as of November 30, 2023.

Randall Glock asked if passengers will be able to see the balance with the new generation faregate. Wendy Wheeler mentioned that the new generation faregates

will not display the balance amount and stated BART does not control the display of balance and Clipper Card company controls this.

Danny Kodmur confirmed that the double-decker faregates, like the ones at Richmond BART Station, will be replaced with the new generation faregates and Wendy Wheeler confirmed this will happen.

Annie Koruga expressed the desire to keep the amount of the Clipper Card on the display when entering and exiting stations. They think it is important to continue to show the balance with the new generation faregate.

Annie Koruga said with the new generation faregates, they hope fare evasion will be cut back dramatically, but expressed that riders may get injured while trying to fare evade. Wendy Wheeler mentioned the number one goal is safety.

5. Introduction to BART Police Department Progressive Policing and Community Engagement Bureau

Supervisor Armando Sandoval introduced the item, BART Police Department Progressive Policing and Community Engagement. He mentioned safety is BART's priority and stated voices from riders like the BATF is why BART Police Department (BDP) created the new Progressive Policy and Community Engagement Bureau.

He went over the different services and programs that BART Police Department (BPD) provides:

- Transit Ambassadors – Provide presence and visibility on trains and at stations. They are equipped with masks, Narcan (to respond to drug overdoses), and a police radio
 - Ten (10) Ambassadors
 - Work seven (7) days a week
 - Work in teams of two
- Crisis Intervention Specialists (CIS) – Background in social work and assess people experiencing mental health and other kinds of crisis
 - Available Mondays through Fridays
 - Three different shifts
 - Provide Customer Service
- “If you see something, say something” – Download the BART Watch app use to discreetly report any concerning situation
 - Text BPD Dispatch
 - Call BPD by phone

- Use the train intercom to speak with the train operator
- Use white emergency phone in the station
- Speak to any uniformed BART staff

Supervisor Armando Sandoval mentioned Transit Ambassadors covers all five (5) counties and all fifty (50) BART Stations. They provide more attention at some stations than other stations. Transit Ambassadors do wear uniforms.

Daveed Mandell expressed concerns in finding Transit Ambassadors within the BART stations or reaching out to a Crisis Intervention Specialist (CIS). He stated he is blind and would like a better way to reach out to people.

Clarence Fischer mentioned in the past there was more presence of BART Police Officers walking the premises, especially on the trains and now there are not as much presence of police and would like to see this happen again.

Emily Witkin mentioned that the Crisis Intervention Specialist (CIS) should be part of the BART Police App.

Annie Koruga was curious what training Crisis Intervention Specialists (CIS) and Transit Ambassadors undergo. Supervisor Armando Sandoval stated that during their tenure, CIS and Transit Ambassadors receive comprehensive and intense training. Annie Koruga would like to see CIS be more available, especially on weekends.

Annie Koruga noticed that occasionally BART Safety Personnel stroll through the station, particularly checking passenger fare media to make sure there are no fare evaders, which can be abrasive. They would want to see more effective means of connecting with riders. Supervisor Armando Sandoval agreed with Annie Koruga and he stated everyone needs to be treated with respect.

Randall Glock mentioned a few years ago, BATF members worked and put together a quick reference for the BART Police Department the General Disabilities Awareness (GDA). He asked whether GDA should be revisited for review and/or to update.

6. New committee member nomination

Randall Glock led the agenda item and introduced Hillary Brown, who is interested in becoming a BATF member.

Hillary Brown introduced herself and expressed why she is interested in joining the BATF.

Daveed Mandell moved to recommend Hillary Brown as a BATF member. Clarence Fischer seconded the motion.

- Motion passes with ten (10) in favor, zero (0) against, and zero (0) abstention

7. Review and approve 2024 BART Accessibility Task Force (BATF) scheduled meeting dates

Randall Glock led agenda item to review and approve the 2024 BART schedule for BATF meeting dates:

1. **January 25, 2024** - Thursday
2. **February 22, 2024** - Thursday
3. **March 28, 2024** - Thursday
4. **April 25, 2024** - Thursday
5. **May 23, 2024** - Thursday
6. **June 27, 2024** - Thursday
7. **July 25, 2024** – Thursday
8. **August 22, 2024** – Thursday
9. **September 26, 2024** - Thursday
10. **October 24, 2024** - Thursday
11. **November 21, 2024** – Thursday
12. **December 19, 2024** – Thursday

Dates reflect the fourth Thursday of each month, January through October. November and December’s meetings are scheduled for the 3rd Thursday for each month.

Meeting time remains the same starting at 2:00 pm and ending around 4:30 pm.

Janice Armigo Brown moved approval of the 2024 BATF scheduled meeting dates. Clarence Fischer seconded the motion.

- Motion passes with nine (9) in favor, against, zero (0), abstention, zero (0)

8. Member Announcements

No member comments.

9. Staff Announcements

Elena Van Loo congratulated Annie Koruga and Bruce Yow, who are officially elected BATF members by the BART Board of Directors on October 12, 2023.

Elena Van Loo shared BATF Holiday Reception flyers will be emailed to BATF members, BART staff, BART Board of Directors, BATF community list on November 1, 2023. She mentioned BATF Holiday Reception is on December 13, 2023 and will be held at the BART Headquarters, 1st Floor Board Room. Meeting starts at 2:00 pm and the holiday reception is from 3:00 pm to 4:30 pm.

10. Chairperson Announcements

No Chairperson comments.

11. Agenda Topics – Member Suggest Topics

- New committee member nomination (s)
 - Alex Tiphayachan
 - Daniel (Danny) Kodmur
- Introduction to Chief BART Police, Kevin Franklin and Deputy Chief BART Polie, Ja'Son Scott
- Train Ambassador and Crisis Intervention Specialists (CIS) guest speaker
- New generation faregate update
 - continuous
- Revisit General Disabilities Awareness (GDA)

12. Adjournment

The meeting adjourned at 4:21 pm until the next regularly scheduled meeting, November 15, 2023, Wednesday at 2pm.