

**SAN FRANCISCO BAY AREA RAPID TRANSIT DISTRICT**  
2150 Webster Street, P.O. Box 12688, Oakland, CA 94604-2688

**BART ACCESSIBILITY TASK FORCE**  
Committee Meeting Minutes  
February 22, 2024

**1. Roll Call of Members:**

1. Alex Tiphayachan - ABSENT
2. Anita Ortega
3. Annie Koruga
4. Bruce Yow
5. Catherine Callahan - ABSENT
6. Clarence Fischer
7. Danny Kodmur
8. Daveed Mandell
9. Don Queen
10. Emily Witkin
11. Hillary Brown
12. Janice Armigo Brown (2<sup>nd</sup> Vice-Chair) - ABSENT
13. Roland Wong (Vice-Chair)
14. VACANT
15. VACANT
16. VACANT
17. VACANT
18. VACANT

Quorum of eight (8) in-person BATF members.

**BART Customer Access and Accessibility Department Staff:**

Elena Van Loo  
Ryan Greene-Roesel  
Bob Franklin

**BART Director (s), BART Staff, Speakers, and members of the public:**

Director Robert Raburn  
Michael Wong (BART Staff)  
Derry Moten (BART Staff)  
Jessica Kirby (Captioner)

Mayra Perez (Captioner)  
Christine Arseneault (Guest)  
Roger Acuna (Guest)  
Herb Hastings (Guest)  
Seraphina Rosmant (Guest)  
Aleta Dupree (Guest)

## **2. Public Comments**

Herb Hastings introduced himself and expressed interest in becoming a BATF member.

Christine Arseneault introduced herself and expressed interest in becoming a BATF member.

## **3. Approval of January 25, 2024 meeting minutes**

A revision to the minutes of the January 25, 2024 meeting was requested by Bruce Yow for the next scheduled meeting, Elena Van Loo will provide the updated meeting minutes for approval.

Clarence Fischer motioned to move January 25, 2024 meeting minutes for approval to the next scheduled BATF meeting. Daveed Mandell seconded the motion.

- Motion passes with nine (9) in favor, zero (0) against, and zero (0) abstention

## **4. Next generation fare gate update**

Michael Wong presented on “Next Generation Fare gate update.”

Michael Wong shared a project overview:

1. Next generation fare gate prototype installed and opened to the public at the West Oakland BART Station in December of 2023.
2. The next generation fare gate is an innovative design, being taller and stronger with modern equipment and advanced sensors
3. Next generation fare gate improves accessibility, reliability, and deters fare evasions
4. Next generation fare gate will be compatible by tapping a credit card or debit card at the fare gate
5. Next generation fare gate installation of about 700 new fare gates will be completed systemwide by the end of 2025

He mentioned the Accessible Fare Gate (AFG) is frameless polycarbonate and it is bi-directional as it is for current fare gate. The AFG does have a tag on the inside to process Clipper cards and mentioned the tag at the top will be working as more next generation fare gates are added. He added the audio tones on the next generation fare gate are the same as on the existing fare gates. Michael Wong mentioned there are sixteen sensors for each next generation fare gate.

Hillary Brown mentioned witnessing fare evasion with the existing fare gates. Michael Wong mentioned the next generation fare gate will be more difficult to fare evade with the new design with taller doors.

Clarence Fischer was concerned that BATF members were not invited to test-run the next generation fare gate before it was installed at West Oakland BART Station to give feedback on accessibility features but wishes to still do a test-run before the next generation fare gates are installed at other BART Stations. Bob Franklin mentioned before the next BATF meeting to have an open-house at West Oakland BART Station to do a test-run and will work with staff to coordinate.

Annie Koruga thanked Michael Wong for his presentation and asked three questions:

1. Are the next generation fare gates going to be installed with different style fare gates or be installed with the same fare gate style. Michael Wong mentioned the next generation fare gates will be installed with the same fare gates but, has not been determined which style to use.
2. There was mentioned of AI (Artificial Intelligence) above the fare gate where it can detect riders going through the gate and wondered where data is stored and who will have access to it and expressed privacy issues. Michael Wong mentioned the AI takes blur visions of riders and that AI is used for not used for tracking purposes.
3. With the existing fare gates, the display shows how much is left on the Clipper card. The next generation fare gate the balance will not be available and would like to know why this is and added showing the balance helps them keep track. Michael Wong will look into this with staff why the next generation fare gate doesn't provide Clipper card balance.

Daveed Mandell would like more detailed descriptions of the next generation fare gate for people who are blind or people with low vision and expressed concerns with the next generation fare gates.

Danny Kodmur asked for confirmation about which of the three prototypes of the fare gates will be used. Michael Wong confirmed one of the prototypes will be used for future installations but hasn't been determined yet.

Emily Witkin wanted to follow up why balance cannot be provided after processing the Clipper Card. She mentioned she noticed when she exits, the machine checks whether she has enough money and asked if there is a delay before the gate opens or do not find out until the end that I have a negative balance. Bob Franklin said this is a good question and will reach out to the proper staff at Clipper to answer Emily Witkin's question.

Herb Hastings asked if the Accessible Fare gate (AFG) will be located near the station agent booth. Michael Wong stated the AFG will be at the same location as the existing fare gates but will be replaced with the next generation fare gates.

Herb Hastings asked if the timing will be shorter when entering and/or exiting the next generation fare gate compared to the existing fare gates remains opens for a few seconds which welcomes fare evasions. Michael Wong stated with the new sensory, the next generation fare gates will close a lot faster.

Roland Wong thanked Michael Wong and Derry Moten for presenting.

## **5. New out-of-service elevator signage**

Elena Van Loo presented on "New out-of-service elevator signage."

She mentioned that this is the start of a brand-new project and that she was interested in hearing from BATF members and members of the public on how to make the signs simple to read and understand, while maintaining consistency.

She shared the purpose of out-of-service elevator signage:

- Need to provide better information on elevator about what to do when an elevator is out-of-service
- We are here to begin the discussion about what information to include on an elevator sign

Elena Van Loo added that there was a presentation in January of 2024, "BART's improved access settlement agreement," and part of the agreement is the elevator mitigation.

She went over types of elevators within the BART system:

- Two elevators needed for access
  - street to concourse
  - concourse to platform
    - multiple platform levels (example: 12<sup>th</sup> St/Oakland City Center BART Station, 19<sup>th</sup> St/Oakland BART Station)

- One elevator needed for access
  - street to concourse to platform (example: Balboa BART Station, Rockridge BART Station)
  - Street to platform (example: Bay Fair BART Station, Orinda BART Station)
- Redundant or alternative elevator (example: Warm Springs/South Fremont BART Station)
- Elevator serving center platform (example: MacArthur BART Station)
- Separate elevators serving side platforms (example: El Cerrito Plaza, El Cerrito del Norte)

She shared examples of scenarios:

- Can't enter the station
- Can't exit the station
- Direction of travel
- Time of day/day of week
  - Bus schedules and drive times vary

Elena Van Loo went over other factors to consider:

- Other elevator signage
  - "Push button for help. Calls will be answered"
  - specialized station – specific signage
- Temporary signage
- Sign size and location restrictions
  - Variable by station

She went over suggestion on what can be on the signage:

- Contact agent for assistance
- Mitigation options
  - Backtrack ("Use elevator to opposite platform and take train one stop in the other direction")
  - Alternative elevator ("Use alternative elevator at "x," location")
  - Elevator mitigation ("Contact agent for shuttle")
  - Transit ("Take transit to adjacent station")
- Phone number?
  - Only on business day hours – for now
- Webpage? QR Code?
- Braille/raised letter?
- Elevator number for reference?

Roland Wong stated that the 19th St./Oakland BART Station has a new elevator that goes from concourse level to platform level on the North end. He would like to see

signage pointing users to the elevator on the South end that goes from concourse level to street level. Bob Franklin mentioned this would be an example as an alternative route if one of the elevators are out of service.

Bob Franklin defined the term "backtracking." He explained that this works on split platforms by using the elevator on the other side of the platform and then taking the train one stop in the opposite direction.

Danny Kodmur asked where the out-of-service signage would be located either inside and/or outside the elevator. Elena Van Loo mentioned the signages will most likely be located outside the elevator but, acknowledged some of the signs will be difficult to decide where to post due to the location of the elevator. She mentioned these new out-of-service will be more of a permanent signage.

Danny Kodmur asked what caused the out-of-service signages to be part of the settlement agreement and how comprehensive the signs will be. Bob Franklin mentioned the intention of the signage and as part of the settlement agreement is to have better communication of what to do when the elevator is out-of-service. Ryan Greene-Roesel added, in a long-term solution, hopefully, is to provide digital signages and work on how to determine the right amount of information to provide to the signages.

Clarence Fischer suggested bus line information on the out-of-service signages and if bus services is not provided is to have advanced accessible vans available. Bob Franklin mentioned part of the settlement is to pilot staged accessible vehicles at BART stations where there may be elevator outages instead of requesting an elevator mitigation trip and to provide better service.

Herb Hastings asked whether the bus bridge is part of the accessible settlement. Ryan Greene-Roesel mentioned this is different from bus bridges and stated bus bridges are used when there is a scheduled track maintenance work.

## **6. December 13, 2023 holiday reception debrief**

Roland Wong led the agenda item and asked BATF members and members of the public feedback who attended December 13, 2023, Holiday Reception.

Hillary Brown stated they had a good time at the holiday reception. They mentioned they were able to meet BART staff and meet General Manager, Robert Powers.

Clarence Fisher mentioned it was good to interact with BART staff from different departments and able to give insight, as a BATF member, to the BART staff.

Daveed Mandell wished staff would approach him and introduce themselves. He stated he is blind and stated he had no idea who was in the room. He hopes next year's event staff will approach him and introduce themselves.

Anita Ortega stated she liked the holiday reception at BART Headquarters (BHQ) and being on the ground level where at the old BART building on Lakeside, it was a hurdle to get to the reception.

Roland Wong thought the reception went well and thanked staff for coordinating the holiday reception.

Herb Hasting stated the reception was really good, especially at the new location, BART Headquarters (BHQ) being accessible.

## **7. Discussion of changing the BATF Holiday Reception date from December 19, 2024 to another date**

Roland Wong led agenda item to discuss whether to change the BATF Holiday Reception from December 19, 2024 to another date.

Elena Van Loo mentioned December 19, 2024, BART Board of Directors have a meeting in the Boardroom that cannot be rescheduled.

Roland Wong asked who would like to make the first motion to change the holiday reception from December 19, 2024, to December 12, 2024. Hillary Brown motioned first and Clarence Fischer seconded the motion.

- Motion passes with ten (10) in favor, zero (0) against, and zero (0) abstention

## **8. BATF committee goals for 2024**

Roland Wong asked Elena Van Loo to lead the agenda item, "BATF committee goals for 2024."

Short and/or long-term goals from BATF member:

1. **Hillary Brown** – Be more involved with the next generation fare gate project and how to prevent fare evasions
2. **Danny Kodmur** – Give feedback on the latest, future fundings with BART along with learning more how funding works

3. **Bruce Yow** – Short term to focus on the next generation fare gates and long term to receive updates on the new BART stations in and around Downtown San Jose
  - a. Santa Clara Valley Transportation Authority (VTA) leads the Downtown San Jose new BART Stations
4. **Clarence Fischer** – Be more involved and give feedback from people with disabilities and seniors on any current, future projects before it is open to the public and be involved with Clipper 2.0
5. **Emily Witkin** – Would like to see more public awareness with the priority seats, especially rider who may have a hidden disability
6. **Annie Koruga** - Would like to be more involved with BART’s policies on accessible services, including economic
7. **Daveed Mandell** – Would like to see better accessibility for people with low vision or blind people and be involved
8. **Anita Ortega** – Would like to see bus and train schedule work together to better transition from BART trains to bus stops
9. **Don Queen** – Would like to more on hands to test out the braille signs and the where to put the braille signages and share with the public the locations of braille signages
10. **Roland Wong** – Agreed with members comments and would like to be more involved in projects related to better, bright lighting for all BART Stations and have accessible pathway signage be more consistent

Herb Hastings would like more updates about the new Downtown San Jose BART Stations that VTA is leading and also wants to be involved with current, future BART projects before piloting.

## 9. Member announcements

Hillary Brown invited BATF members and members of the public to attend the MTC meeting focusing on what MTC’s role is in the Bay Area and will share the meeting information.

## 10. Staff announcements

Bob Franklin announced Randall Glock resigned as a BATF member.

Elena Van Loo announced there will be nominations and elections for Chair, Vice-Chair, and 2<sup>nd</sup> Vice-Chair scheduled for March 28, 2024.

Elena Van Loo announced two new member recommendations to be scheduled at the next BATF meeting, March 28, 2024, for Christine Arseneault and Herb Hastings.



## **11. Chairperson announcements**

Roland Wong announced he was honored to be the chair for today's meeting and covered a lot during this meeting. He asked members to think about running for either Chair, Vice-Chair, or 2<sup>nd</sup> Vice-Chair and to reach out to staff if there's any questions.

## **12. Agenda Topics – Member Suggest Topics**

- New member nominations
  - Christine Arseneault
  - Herb Hastings
- Nominations and Elections
  - Chair
  - Vice-Chair
  - 2<sup>nd</sup> Vice-Chair
- 19<sup>th</sup> St. BART Station signage near North elevator
- How to file a complaint related to accessibility and/or public feedback
  - access barrier
- BART's media
  - Look into adding, for people who are blind or have low vision, either "alt text," description to pictures in the BART social media posts, or an add-on certain image description
    - Facebook
    - Twitter
    - Instagram
    - BART website

## **13. Adjournment**

Clarence Fisher made a motion to adjourn the meeting in honoring Randall Glock for his dedication to BATF.

The meeting adjourned at 4:13 pm until the next regularly scheduled meeting, Thursday, March 28, 2024 at 2pm.