

**SAN FRANCISCO BAY AREA RAPID TRANSIT DISTRICT**  
2150 Webster Street, P.O. Box 12688, Oakland, CA 94604-2688

**BART ACCESSIBILITY TASK FORCE**  
Committee Meeting Minutes  
November 09, 2022

**1. Roll Call of Members:**

1. Anita Ortega
2. Catherine Callahan
3. Clarence Fischer
4. David Fritz
5. Don Queen
6. Emily Witkin - ABSENT
7. Gerry Newell (Vice-Chair)
8. Hale Zukas
9. Herb Hastings (2<sup>nd</sup> Vice-Chair)
10. Janet Abelson
11. Janice Armigo Brown - ABSENT
12. Larry Bunn
13. Marjorie (Marji) McWee
14. Randall Glock (Chair)
15. Roland Wong
16. Shay Roberson
17. Valerie Buell
18. VACANT

**BART Customer Access and Accessibility Department Staff:**

Elena Van Loo  
Laura Timothy  
Bob Franklin

**BART Director (s), BART Staff, Speakers, and members of the public:**

Robert Raburn (BART Board of Directors)  
Wendy Wheeler (BART Staff)  
Rachel Factor (BART Staff)  
Greg Lombardi (BART Staff)  
David Coggshall (BART Staff)

Bert Wagner (BART Staff)  
Ahmad Rassai (BART Staff)  
Bridgett Nolot (Captioner)  
Alicia Garispe (Captioner)  
Natalie Maxwell (Guest)  
Shervin Keshmiri (Guest)  
Sara Desumala (Guest)

## **2. Public Comments**

Sara Desumala mentioned the Embarcadero BART Station Accessible Faregate at the platform level keeps breaking down and riders are fare evading.

Natalie Maxwell introduced themselves from Center of Independent Living in Berkeley, California.

## **3. Approval of September 22, 2022 Meeting Minutes**

Clarence Fischer moved approval of the September 22, 2022 meeting minutes with the amendments. Herb Hastings seconded the motion.

- Motion passes with twelve (12) in favor, zero (0) against, one (1) abstention

## **4. Accessibility Update (Elevator Enclosure Fare Gates)**

Wendy Wheeler presented, “Accessibility update (elevator enclosure fare gates).”

Wendy Wheeler shared that the Accessible Faregate (AFG) double panel swing doors will be changed to single panel swing gate and more will be added as we move forward:

- Bay Fair BART Station, single panel installed August 06, 2022
  - Double panel installed July 14, 2021
- Coliseum BART Station, scheduled for November 11, 2022
- Richmond BART Station, scheduled for December 16, 2022
- Concord BART Station, scheduled for January 2023
- Montgomery BART Station, To Be Determined (TBD)
- Fruitvale BART Station, To Be Determined (TBD)
- Balboa Park BART Station, To Be Determined (TBD)

Wendy Wheeler mentioned elevator enclosure at Rockridge BART Station had been completed in July of 2022 and the elevator enclosure at Walnut Creek BART Station had been completed in September of 2022.

### Scheduled Remaining Stations:

- Civic Center Plaza BART Station – November 2022
- Powell Street (SF) BART Station – December 2022
- Orinda BART Station – December 2022

### Completed Stations:

- Coliseum (Oakland) BART Station – September 2020
- Concord BART Station – October 2020
- Montgomery BART Station – December 2020
- Bay Fair BART Station – July 2021
- Balboa Park BART Station – August 2021
- Embarcadero BART Station – December 2021
- El Cerrito Plaza – May 2022
- Rockridge BART Station – July 2022
- Walnut Creek BART Station – September 2022

### Previously Completed:

- 12<sup>th</sup> St. (Oakland) BART Station – Railing was added
- South Hayward BART Station – Railing was added
- Berkeley (Downtown) BART Station – Railing was added
- El Cerrito del Norte BART Station – Station Modernization
- 19<sup>th</sup> St. (Oakland) BART Station – Station Modernization

### Enclosures Not Required:

- Lake Merritt BART Station – Railings added to enclosure elevator in the paid area  
Elevator #140
- South Hayward BART Station – Railings added to enclosure elevator in the paid area  
Elevator #9
- 12<sup>th</sup> St. (Oakland) BART Station - Railings added to enclosure elevator in the  
paid area – Elevator #23
- 19<sup>th</sup> St. (Oakland) BART Station – Railings added to enclosure elevator in the paid  
area – Elevator #25
- Ashby BART Station – Railings added to enclosure elevator in the paid area –  
Elevator #111
- Berkeley (Downtown) BART Station – Railings added to enclosure elevator in the  
paid area – Elevator #45
- El Cerrito del Norte BART Station – Railings added to enclosure elevator in the paid  
area – Elevator #164
- El Cerrito del Norte BART Station – Railings added to enclosure elevator in the paid  
area – Elevator #165
- Millbrae BART Station – Railings added to enclose in the paid area – Elevator #108

Wendy Wheeler gave an update on elevator signages and destination signages.

### Elevator Status Signs:

- Remaining Stations:
  - Pittsburg/Bay Point BART Station
  - Antioch BART Station
  - Oakland International Airport (OAK) BART Station
  - West Dublin/Pleasanton BART Station
  - North Berkeley BART Station
- Completed Lines
  - A Line – August 2022
  - C Line – September 2022
  - K Line – August 2022
  - M Line – September 2022
  - S Line – September 2022
  - W Line – September 2022
  - Y Line – September 2022

### Destination Signs:

- Scheduled Remaining Stations
  - Civic Center Plaza (SF) BART Station – February 2023
  - Powell St. (SF) BART Station – February 2023
  - Embarcadero (SF) BART Station – March 2023
  - 16<sup>th</sup> St. (SF) BART Station – May 2023
  - Berkeley (Downtown) BART Station – July 2023
  - 19<sup>th</sup> St. (Oakland) BART Station – October 2023
  - 12<sup>th</sup> St. (Oakland) BART Station – January 2024
  - 24<sup>th</sup> St. (SF) BART Station – March 2024
  - Glen Park (SF) BART Station – May 2024
- Completed Station
  - Lake Merritt (Oakland)

Randall Glock asked why Embarcadero BART Station and Richmond BART Station Accessible Faregates (AFG) are frequently out of order. Wendy Wheeler mentioned she is aware of this and mentioned Richmond BART Station will replace its double panel faregates with a single panel faregate.

Roland Wong mentioned he was at Lake Merritt BART Station and expressed how he liked the new digital signages. Wendy Wheeler appreciated Roland Wong's feedback and mentioned staff worked really hard to make the digital signages work.

Roland Wong stated that he is glad to hear accessible faregates will be changed from double panel swing gate to a single panel swing gate.

Catherine Callahan voiced a couple of concerns with Rockridge BART Station and Embarcadero BART Station at which both are elevator enclosures. She mentioned she used both stations to go to and from work and expressed that retrofitting to the single panel swing faregate will not fix the problem because the swinging faregate (s) are still routinely broken. Catherine Callahan stated that this really impedes her daily commute and it is placing an undue burden with people with disabilities to not know whether or not the accessible faregate (s) are working. She asked if there is a way to give people access to whether or not those faregates are actually operational like done with elevators out of service (s). Wendy Wheeler mentioned she will take this idea to her team.

Herb Hastings complemented the new digital signages. He mentioned that there was quick notice of delay on the new digital signages along with overhead announcements and this is helpful to the riders.

Clarence Fisher asked why Montgomery BART Station does not have the new digital signages. Wendy Wheeler mentioned she and her staff will look into this.

David Fritz suggested signs on the elevator at the street level or non-faregate level that can direct riders the correct faregate to pay at the accessible faregates.

Robert Raburn had two questions. He asked if the new destination signages are technically capable of being deployed in external exterior platform situations. Wendy Wheeler mentioned the first round of funding received will focused on the underground stations and when additional funding comes the focus will be for the outside signages.

Second question from Robert Raburn asked if the Request for Proposal (RFP) for the next generation of faregates include the Accessible Faregates (AFG). Wendy Wheeler stated that there will funding focusing on AGFs' for the upcoming proposals.

Wendy Wheeler shared that there are three ways Accessible Faregates (AFG) can be opened other than using your clipper card or BART magstriped ticket:

1. The Station Agent has the ability to do an emergency barrier override from the station agent booth
2. If there's a power outage, the AFGs should open automatically. Operation Control Center (OCC) can also open them remotely, and the Station Agent can do the same.
3. Operation Control Center (OCC) has the ability to override faregate (s) remotely as well as the BART Police Department

## **5. Update on Measure-RR Funded Safe Routes to BART Grant Program**

Rachel Factor presented, “Update on Measure RR-funded Safe Routes to BART Grant Program.”

Rachel Factor shared the revised Measure RR draft summary of investment and highlighted that \$135 million (which is about 4% of the bond) goes to expand opportunities to safely access station which includes safety, reliability, and crowding (traffic relief) under benefits.

### **Intended Allocation by Mode (\$135 million):**

Active Access (including safe routes) – \$77 million

Shared Mobility – \$25 million

Seniors, People with Disabilities – \$25 million

Drive and Park – \$9 million

Rachel Factor mentioned funding will be partnered with MTC Lifeline, One Bay Area Grant, Active Transportation Program, etc. Also, will be partnered with Regional/County Transportation Fund for Clean Air Program (TFCA) funds, California Cap-and-Trade (SB1), and Affordable Housing + Sustainable Communities Program (AHSC).

Rachal Factor shared program goals, two different cycle timelines, along with funding under Measure RR program. She also shared some improvements to be done, tentative evaluation process, and tentative scheduled timeline.

Randall Glock thanked Rachel Factor for her presentation.

## **6. BART Station Access Signage Standards Website - Reminder**

Randall Glock reminded BATF members and the public to provide comments under BART’s link, [www.bart.gov/about/planning/station-access/station-signage](http://www.bart.gov/about/planning/station-access/station-signage) about wayfinding at BART. He conveyed this is an opportunity to share your thoughts about wayfinding throughout the BART System.

## **7. Review and Approve Year 2023 BATF Scheduled Meeting Dates.**

Randall Glock led agenda item to review and approve 2023 BATF scheduled meeting dates.

Herb Hasting motioned to discuss whether to have a meeting on November 8, 2023 or November 15, 2023. Shay Roberson seconded the motion.

Herb Hastings asked why there is a reason to schedule a meeting on the third Wednesday of November when BATF meetings has been scheduled for the second Wednesday. Randall Glock verified that there was a proposal to have the November's meeting for the third Wednesday.

Roland Wong, Valerie Buell, and Gerry Newell stated November 15, 2023 meeting works best due to there is a short time between October 26<sup>th</sup> to November 8<sup>th</sup> of 2023 and will give staff more time to prepare for November 15<sup>th</sup> of 2023.

Marjorie McWee motioned to vote for either November 8<sup>th</sup> or November 15<sup>th</sup> of 2023. Roland Wong seconded the motion.

- Motion passes with eleven (11) in favor, one (1) against, one (1) abstention

Marjorie McWee motioned to vote to approve scheduled meetings from January 2023 to October 2023 and approve December 13, 2023. Gerry Newell seconded the motion.

BATF members voted unanimously approved January 2023 to October 2023 scheduled meeting and BATF members voted unanimously to approve December 13, 2023.

Approved 2023 BATF Scheduled Meeting dates (2:00 pm to 4:30 pm):

- January 26, 2023, Thursday
- February 23, 2023, Thursday
- March 23, 2023, Thursday
- April 27, 2023, Thursday
- May 25, 2023, Thursday
- June 22, 2023, Thursday
- July 27, 2023, Thursday
- August 24, 2023, Thursday
- September 28, 2023, Thursday
- October 26, 2023, Thursday
- November 15, 2023, Wednesday
- December 13, 2023, Wednesday

Randall Glock asked when in-person meetings will take place. Elena Van Loo mentioned she and staff continues to communicate with District Secretary's Office to

see when it is the best, safest time to resume in-person meetings. Elena Van Loo added it is important that BATF members and members of the public feel safe when in-person meeting resumes.

## **8. BATF Holiday Reception Planning for December 2022 – Discussion**

Members discussed whether to have a BATF Holiday Reception scheduled for December 14, 2022 through Webinar.

Roland Wong mentioned doing BART Holiday Reception through Webinar is more difficult than in-person.

Valerie Buell thinks we should try to have the Holiday Reception through Webinar for networking reasons and Herb Hasting agrees with Valerie Buell's statement.

Gerry Newell recommends cancelling December's meeting and do a meet-and-greet at a later time when we can do it in-person.

Marjorie McWee stated if there's not a robust agenda for December that we cancel the meeting and postpone the gathering until it is safe to do so.

Elena Van Loo shared BATF did have a meet-and-greet through Webinar with the GM, assistant GMs, and BART Staff a couple years ago. She mentioned we need to follow the Brown Act Law and beware of meet-and-greet versus specific projects being discussed.

Randall Glock ended the discussion by stating if there are not enough agenda items for December's meeting is to resume in January 2023.

## **9. Member Announcements**

Roland Wong shared he participated in a rare, open to the public, tour at the BART Hayward Maintenance Complex on October 27, 2022 and stated it was successful. He added it was fully accessible and thanked Paratransit for their wonderful service. Randall Glock agreed with Roland Wong's statement.

Herb Hastings announced he is the newest member of the Interagency Transportation Equity Advisory Committee (TEAC).



## **10. Staff Announcements**

Elena Van Loo announced she will be mailing “Thank you, Happy Holidays,” BART swag bags to BATF members.

Ahmad Rassai announced he will be presenting an update on Accessible Improvement Program (AIP) budget at a later date that focuses on making corrections, improvements under the Americans with Disabilities (ADA) within the station, outside the stations, parking lots, garages, sidewalks, etc.

## **11. Chairperson Announcements**

Herb Hastings, 2<sup>nd</sup> Vice-Chair, visited 19<sup>th</sup> Street BART Station and visited the new restrooms. He thought the restrooms were too dark and would like to see bright lighting installed.

## **12. Future Agenda Topics – Member Suggest Topics**

- BART Survey Takers at BART Station
  - Job description and what department does surveyors work from
- Discussion of Chair terms, Vice-Chair terms, & 2nd Chair terms
- Discussion to add ad hoc committee
  - Smaller committee to recruit new BATF member (s)

## **13. Adjournment**

The meeting adjourned at 4:03 pm until the next regularly scheduled meeting, January 26, 2023.