

**SAN FRANCISCO BAY AREA RAPID TRANSIT DISTRICT**  
300 Lakeside Drive, P.O. Box 12688, Oakland, CA 94604-2888

**BART Police Citizen Review Board**  
**Monday, September 10, 2018**

A regular meeting of the BART Police Citizen Review Board (BPCRB) was held on Monday, September 10, 2018 convening at 4:00 p.m. in the BART Board Room, 344 20<sup>th</sup> Street, Oakland, California.

Members Present: Chairperson George Perezvelez, Vice Chairperson William White, Kenneth Loo, Pete Longmire, Darren White, Les Mensinger, and Richard Knowles.

BART Staff: BART Police Department (BPD) Chief of Police Carlos Rojas, BPD Deputy Chief Lance Haight, BPD Deputy Chief Jeffrey Jennings, BPD Lieutenant Kevin Franklin, BPD Officer Stephen Christ, Independent Police Auditor Russell Bloom, Independent Police Investigator Patrick Caceres, Senior Administrative Analyst Sarah Celso, BPD Senior Administrative Analyst LaTonia Peoples-Stokes, Interim District Secretary Patricia Williams, BPD Temporary Staff Assistant Sharon Kidd.

Others Present: BART Director Debora Allen, BART Director Robert Raburn, and Members of the Public.

Agenda items discussed:

- 1. Call to Order.**  
The regular meeting was called to order at 4:01 p.m. by Chairperson George Perezvelez.
- 2. Call for Quorum.**  
Chairperson George Perezvelez, Vice Chair William White, Kenneth Loo, Pete Longmire, Les Mensinger, and Richard Knowles were present, amounting to a quorum.
- 3. Pledge of Allegiance Recital.**  
The pledge of allegiance was recited.  
  
A motion to adjourn the meeting in memory of those that lost their lives in the September 11, 2001 attacks was made by Chairperson Perezvelez and seconded by Mr. W. White. The motion passed unanimously.
- 4. Approval of Minutes of Prior Board Meeting. For Discussion and Action.**  
A motion to approve the minutes for the prior Board meeting was made by Mr. Longmire and seconded by Mr. Mensinger. The motion passed unanimously.

**5. Quarterly Reports to the BART Board of Directors for Quarter 1 2018 and Quarter 2 2018. For Discussion and Action.**

A motion to approve the Quarter 1 2018 Report to BART Board of Directors was made by Mr. Mensinger and seconded by Mr. Knowles. The motion passed with five in favor, zero against and one abstention.

Mr. D. White entered the meeting at 4:08 p.m.

A motion to approve the Quarter 2 2018 Report to the BART Board of Directors with the addition that Mr. Loo participated on an oral board in June was made by Mr. Mensinger and seconded by Mr. Knowles. The motion passed with six votes in favor, zero against and one abstention.

Chairperson Perezvelez addressed a Member of the Public regarding Item #9 - General Discussion and Public Comment.

**6. Force Option Simulation Training. For Discussion Only.**

Chairperson Perezvelez, Vice Chairperson W. White, Mr. Loo, Mr. Longmire and Mr. Caceres attended the Force Option Simulation Training at BPD.

The BPCRB members that attended the training shared their experiences and expressed their appreciation to BPD Staff for providing the training.

**7. Chief of Police's Report. For Discussion and Action.**

Chief Rojas expressed his appreciation to the BPCRB and Mr. Caceres for their participation in the Force Option Simulation Training.

a. BPD Monthly Report for July 2018

Chief Rojas presented the BPD Monthly Report for July 2018 and he answered questions from the BPCRB.

**8. BPCRB Participation in BPD Commendation Process. For Discussion and Action.**

*This item has been moved to #10 on the Agenda.*

Chairperson Perezvelez called for a 10-minute recess at 4:32 p.m.

The meeting reconvened at 4:43 p.m.

Vice Chairperson W. White addressed Members of the Public.

Chairperson Perezvelez addressed Members of the Public.

**9. General Discussion and Public Comment. Limited to 3 minutes per speaker.**

(An opportunity for members of the public to address the BPCRB on matters under their jurisdiction and not on the agenda.)

*This item was originally #10 on the Agenda.*

Chairperson Perezvelez called for Public Comment.

The following individuals addressed the BPCRB in support of the Sahleem Tindle family regarding the Officer-Involved Shooting on January 3, 2018.

Nailah Watkins  
Afiyah Chambers  
Lonnie Monroe  
Peter Alexander (Mr. Alexander also addressed the BPCRB regarding Agenda Item #3)  
Yolanda Banks-Reed  
Karim Mayfield

Chairperson Perezvelez called for a 5-minute recess at 5:23 p.m.

The meeting reconvened at 5:30 p.m.

**10. BPCRB Participation in BPD Commendation Process. For Discussion and Action.**

*This item was originally #8 on the Agenda.*

Chairperson Perezvelez presented a document for this item and he discussed the item.

The BPCRB discussed this item.

A motion to forward the BPCRB Participation in BPD Commendation Process document to Chief Rojas' consideration was made by Mr. Mensinger and seconded by Mr. Longmire. The motion passed unanimously.

**11. Independent Police Auditor's Report. For Discussion and Action.**

*This item was originally #9 on the Agenda.*

- a. Office of the Independent Police Auditor (OIPA) Monthly Report for August 2018.  
Mr. Bloom presented the OIPA Monthly Report for August 2018 and he answered questions from the BPCRB.

A motion to extend the meeting to 6:20 p.m. was made by Mr. D. White and seconded by Mr. Mensinger. The motion passed unanimously.

The BPCRB convened into closed session at 6:09 p.m.

**12. Closed Session.**

*This item was originally #11 on the Agenda.*

- a. To Consider Public Employee Discipline/Dismissal/Release in Office of the Independent Police Auditor Case #18-03. Gov. Code §54957

The BPCRB reconvened in open session at 6:16 p.m.

Chairperson Perezvelez announced the vote taken during the closed session with regard to agenda item #12a. The BPCRB voted unanimously to accept the findings reached by OIPA with seven votes in favor, zero against and zero abstentions.

**13. Adjournment.**

*This item was originally #12 on the Agenda.*

A motion to adjourn the meeting in memory of those that lost their lives on September 11, 2001 attacks was by Mr. Mensinger and seconded by Mr. Longmire. The motion passed unanimously.

The meeting was adjourned at approximately 6:16 p.m.